Terms and Conditions of the 'Young Labs' (YL) action in the Anthropocene PRA under the strategic programme Excellence Initiative at the Jagiellonian University

in the academic year 2020/2021

for founding or consolidating a research team to carry out research within the thematic scope of the Anthropocene PRA

I. Definitions

The following definitions apply throughout these Terms and Conditions:

- 1. **ELJU**: the programme Excellence Initiative at the Jagiellonian University.
- 2. JU: Jagiellonian University.
- 3. **Anthropocene PRA**: the Anthropocene Priority Research Area, as specified in the Jagiellonian University's application in the "Excellence Initiative Research University" competition.
- 4. **Terms and Conditions**: these Terms and Conditions of the 'Young Labs' (YL) action in the Anthropocene PRA under the strategic programme Excellence Initiative under the Strategic Programme Excellence Initiative at the Jagiellonian University in the academic year 2020/2021 for founding or consolidating a research team to carry out research within the thematic scope of the Anthropocene PRA, serving to create young leaders of science through the funding of projects conducted by them under the call (hereinafter: 'the project' or 'the YL project').
- 5. Call or the Young Labs call: the call launched pursuant to these Terms and Conditions.
- 6. **Applicant**: a person employed by the JU, in charge of communication with the call host and the call committee, who
 - a) has held a doctoral degree for up to 4, and seeks funding for launching a research collaboration and founding their first research team ('My First Lab, MFL'),
 - b) has held a doctoral degree for more than 4 years and up to 9 years, and seeks funding for maintaining or expanding an existing research collaboration, or initiating a new one, and for consolidating their position of a young leader of science ('My Advanced Lab, MAL').

- 7. **YL Project Manager**: an Applicant whose proposal has been recommended for funding as a result of a call procedure.
- 8. **Team**: the YL Project Manager and all persons involved in the implementation of the YL project, jointly carrying out research. In the action Young Labs, the Team is not a formal structure, and a fixed personnel is not required.

II. General regulations

- 1. The aim of the call is to support young researchers financially in founding or consolidating a research team, or expanding research collaboration. The action thus seeks to help initiate or continue research activity within the thematic scope of the Anthropocene PRA, and to support the development of the ability to apply for research funding from external resources.
- 2. The call governed by these Terms and Conditions is launched by the Coordinator of the Anthropocene PRA. Operating of the call in accordance with the provisions of these Terms and Conditions is the responsibility of the Call Committee. Chair of the Call Committee is the Coordinator of the Anthropocene PRA or a person authorised by them.
- 3. The years after the award of a doctoral degree do not include years of maternity leave, adoption leave, paternity leave, parental leave or child-care leave, granted on terms specified in the Act of 26 June 1974, Labour Code, the periods of receiving maternity allowance or parental benefits, periods of receiving sick pay or rehabilitation benefit on account of incapacity to work, including incapacity caused by a condition requiring medical rehabilitation, pursuant to relevant laws.
- 4. YL Project Managers may not be persons holding a habilitated doctor degree or a full professor title.
- 5. Persons involved in the implementation of Young Labs projects and members of the Team may be JU staff and JU as well as non-JU students, as well as investigators from outside the JU.
- 6. The call is open to applicants who will carry out research related to the domains and disciplines specified for the Anthropocene PRA in the founded teams (at least one of the

disciplines named in the proposal must be selected from among those specified for the Anthropocene PRA: https://anthropocene.id.uj.edu.pl/strategia).

- 7. An applicant may solely be a person who over the period of project implementation will be counted in the N number in one of the disciplines covered by the Anthropocene PRA research areas (included in the strategy of the Anthropocene PRA, https://anthropocene.id.uj.edu.pl/strategia).
- 8. Tasks submitted for implementation under the YL action in the Anthropocene PRA may not be funded from other sources (e.g. the NCN, NCBR, Foundation for Polish Science and other Polish or foreign research funding institutions), including other actions under the Anthropocene PRA programme, with the exception of the action Open Access.
- 9. The YL Project Manager and Team Members, including students and doctoral students, may not be simultaneously receiving allowances / salaries / scholarships under other projects in the Anthropocene PRA.

III. Project implementation time, terms of funding

- 1. The project is carried out over:
- a) in the case of 'My First Lab' 24 or 30 months,
- b) in the case of 'My Advanced Lab' 12 or 24 months
- (by way of exception the period of project implementation may be prolonged, up to and additional year; the prolongation of the period of project implementation does not secure any additional funding). Projects must be completed before the conclusion of the EI.JU programme.
- 2. The overall budget in a project proposed for funding may not exceed: PLN 200,000 (including salary surcharges).
- 3. Budget in the project should be planned in a rational manner, in accordance with the principle of economy and cost effectiveness. No overheads need be included in the cost estimate. Before proposal submission, the cost estimate should be consulted with the office of the ELJU regarding formal eligibility.
- 4. Covered under the project budget may be:

a) cost of purchase of fixed assets (inventoried by the JU Department of Property Records), as well as:

b) the cost of:

- trips (e.g. conferences, research trips, conference fees, fellowships, library and archive searches, field studies) and research visits and consultations;
- consumables;
- services;
- other, directly related to doing research and disseminating its results, with the exception of: article / monograph open access publication cost, translations;

c) personnel costs:

- periodic / one-off / specific-task benefits added to the salaries of the YL Project Manager and members of the Team employed by the JU (known as research assistants) pursuant to the Regulations of remuneration of the Jagiellonian University employees;
- civil-law contract salaries for investigators from outside the JU, students and doctoral students participating in the implementation of the project.
- 5. Personnel costs should be proportionate to the degree of the participant's involvement in the project.
- 6. Remuneration in the project must follow the internal regulations of the Jagiellonian University, including the Regulations of remuneration of the Jagiellonian University employees.

IV. Principles of submitting proposals

- 1. The proposals should be drawn up in English and submitted solely electronically by means of an entry form available at https://strefaid.uj.edu.pl (information on the entry form Annex 1 to Terms and Conditions). Proposals submitted by other means (e.g. via email) will not be considered.
- 2. Proposals must be submitted within the time frame specified in the call announcement. Proposals submitted after the deadline will not be considered.

V. Call procedure

1. Projects to be implemented shall be selected following a call procedure. Each proposal shall be reviewed by a call committee, experts and reviewers with expertise in the disciplines

indicated by the applicant in the proposal. Detailed proposal evaluation criteria can be perused in the Annex 3 to these Terms and Conditions.

- 2. The mode of appointing the call committee and the mode of proposal evaluation and call conclusion are specified in the Annex 3 to these Terms and Conditions. List of members of the call committee shall be made public once the call has been concluded.
- 3. In the first stage of the call, the call committee shall verify the proposals' formal eligibility. Proposals failing to meet the formal eligibility criteria shall not be subject to further evaluation.
- 4. In the second stage of the call, the proposals shall be evaluated with regard to their merit-based quality by experts. Proposals approved by the experts shall be passed on to reviewers for review.
- 5. Results of the call shall be announced within 4 months of the deadline for submissions.

VI. Project implementation and settlement

- 1. YL Project Managers are obliged to present at half time into the project implementation (no earlier, however, than within one year of commencing the project) a report on the implementation of the project's schedule and the manner of disbursement of the funding. In the event of finding irregularities in the implementation of the project, the chair of the call committee may decide to withhold funding of the project.
- 2. Projects shall be settled based on a final report, drawn up within 60 days of the date of concluding the project. This deadline may be prolonged only by way of especially justified exception, albeit no more than by 30 days,
- 3. Within six months of the date of concluding the call, the YL Project Manager may complete their final report with publications / monographs / books / patents and other results of the project implementation, and with information on submitted project proposals.
- 4. Project's obligatory (minimum) results to constitute the basis for its settlement are:

a) with regard to 'My First Lab' projects and 'My Advanced Lab' projects: submission by the YL Project Manager of an application for the extension of funding to the research conducted within the thematic scope of the Anthropocene PRA, to an external research funding institution;

and

b) with regard to 'My First Lab' and 'My Advanced Lab' projects:

• <u>in the domain of humanities</u> (disciplines: archaeology, history, philosophy) <u>and in the domain of social sciences</u> (disciplines: economy and finance, socioeconomic geography and spatial management, politics and administration, management and quality studies, legal sciences, sociology) and <u>in the domain of exact and life sciences</u> (disciplines: mathematics, computer science, technical informatics and telecommunications, Earth and environmental science)

at least one scholarly publication in a discipline represented in the Anthropocene PRA published in an academic journal or in reviewed proceedings from an international conference, listed in the *Inventory of academic journals and reviewed proceedings of international conferences* published by the Polish Ministry of Education and Science, as of the day of proposal submission, of which at least one is classified in a group with at least 100 ranking points, (including a document stating approval for publication),

or

at least one monograph by a publisher of reviewed research monographs listed in the *Inventory of academic journals and reviewed proceedings of international conferences* published by the Polish Ministry of Science and Higher Education / Ministry of Education and Science, as **Level 1 or 2** (including a document stating approval for publication),

or

at least one chapter in a monograph by a publisher of reviewed research monographs listed in the *Inventory of academic journals and reviewed proceedings of international conferences* published by the Polish Ministry of Science and Higher Education /

Ministry of Education and Science, as **Level 2** (including a document stating approval for publication),

• <u>in the domain of exact and life sciences</u> (disciplines: astronomy, chemical sciences, physical sciences):

at least one publication in a discipline represented in the Anthropocene PRA published in an academic journal or in reviewed proceedings from an international conference, listed in the *Inventory of academic journals and reviewed proceedings of international conferences* published by the Polish Ministry of Education and Science as of the day of proposal submission, classified in a group with at least 140 ranking points (including a document stating approval for publication),

or

at least one monograph by a publisher of reviewed research monographs listed in the *Inventory of academic journals and reviewed proceedings of international conferences* published by the Polish Ministry of Science and Higher Education / Ministry of Education and Science, as **Level 2** (including a document stating approval for publication),

and

- c) with regard to 'My First Lab' projects and 'My Advanced Lab' projects: it is also expected that the results listed in the project proposal will be achieved, e.g. development of international collaboration, papers delivered at conferences, fellowships at foreign research centres, dissemination of the research results through community outreach, research popularisation actions.
- 5. The essential (minimum) condition of receiving a positive note of the final YL report is to achieve the obligatory project goals (point 4) within 6 months of the date of project conclusion. A project's additional result will be admission of a submitted proposal (point 4.a) to the second stage of evaluation and/or securing funding to a proposal submitted within one year of the date of concluding the YL project. The Project Manager is obliged to inform the chair of the YL call

committee regarding recommendation of the above mentioned grant proposal to second stage of a call or award of funding.

- 6. In the event of serious financial irregularities, i.e. using the funding for other purposes than those specified in point III.4 or using the items, materials, and rights purchased with the above mentioned funding for purposes other than those specified in these Terms and Conditions, the YL Project Manager is held liable to the full extent of the generally applicable Polish law, including as laid down in the Act of 20 July 2018, Law on higher education and science, and n the Act of 26 June 1974, Labour Code.
- 7. Failure to settle the project precludes the applicant from applying for funding under other calls in the Anthropocene PRA.

VII. Additional provisions

1. All publications, conference papers and other works resulting from the research funded under the YL action in the Anthropocene PRA shall include information on the source of funding: "Niniejsza publikacja została sfinansowana ze środków Priorytetowego Obszaru Badawczego Anthropocene w ramach programu "Inicjatywa Doskonałości – Uczelnia Badawcza" w Uniwersytecie Jagiellońskim."

"This publication has been funded from the Anthropocene Priority Research Area budget under the program "Excellence Initiative – Research University" at the Jagiellonian University.".

2. Funding under the YL action in the Anthropocene PRA may be granted to a given project only once.

VIII. Final provisions

- 1. The Applicant declares that they accept these Terms and Conditions, and undertake to comply with their provisions, under pain of losing the right to apply for funding under the YL action in the Antrhopocene PRA.
- 2. These Terms and Conditions are effective as of the day of signing.

Annex 1 to Terms and Conditions: information on the entry form

The proposals should be drawn up in English and submitted solely electronically by means of an entry form available at https://strefaid.uj.edu.pl.

Before drawing up the proposal the applicant shall log in to the application system and make themselves familiar with the electronic entry form.

The proposal's entry form shall be filled out with (among others) the following information:

- application type: grant: 'My First Lab, MFL' or grant: 'My Advanced Lab, MAL,'
- information on the applicant: full name, applicant type (their post), the scientific discipline represented by the applicant, defined for the Anthropocene PRA, date of receiving the doctoral degree,
- project information: title, project type (only research project), summary,
- research domains: defined for the Anthropocene PRA,
- research disciplines:
- Scopus subject areas,
- project implementation time: in the case of 'My First Lab' 24 or 30 months, in the case of 'My Advanced Lab' 12 or 24 months,
- detailed description of the project: project aims, significance of the project, state of the art in thematic scope of the research, research concept and methodology, concept of the project intended as continuation to pre-existing research (including information on potential partners and a funding institution),
- the applicant's experience conducting research: list up to 5 research achievements from the entire period of academic activity,
- project team: members of the Team implementing the project, including the investigators' abilities,
- information on access to equipment necessary to carry out the project,
- project's relevance to the EI.JU program goals, the "4I" principle, and the programme indicators: the project must meet at least the criteria of interdisciplinarity and internationalisation (the 4I principle),
- the project's relevance to the Anthropocene PRA thematic scope,
- project implementation plan and schedule: tasks should be defined separately: name of the task, start and end dates, cost (including personnel costs), task description, cost justification,

- the project's products / results: select from the list the obligatory project deliverables resulting from the call's terms and conditions (such as submission of a research funding proposal to an external institution etc.) and other possible deliverables, declared in the proposal (see: the Call's Terms and Conditions).

- annexes

Annexes

Applicant's declarations

The applicant submitting the project: title

declares that:

- 1. They have submitted in their Entity a declaration of being counted in the N Number in one of the disciplines specified for the Anthropocene PRA.
- 2. Tasks planned for implementation in the proposal or tasks thematically related have not been funded by other research funding institutions, including other actions under the EI.JU programme.
- 3. They are not applying for funding of the research planned in the proposal or thematically similar research at research funding institutions at home or abroad (e.g. NCN, NCBR).
- 4. The proposal has been drawn up in accordance with good scholarly practice.
- 5. If the research planned within the project requires additional approvals or permissions (an approval or positive opinion from the applicable bioethics committee, an approval from the applicable animal experimentation ethics committee, an approval based on regulations on microorganisms and genetically modified organisms, an approval or permission for research on protected species or in protected areas, other permissions, according to the principles of good practice in a particular research field/discipline), the YL Project Manager shall provide the required documents immediately upon the selection of the proposal for funding, before the commencement of the project implementation. Funding of the actions under the project may not commence before relevant documents have been submitted.
- 6. Should the project receive funding, the Applicant agrees to have the information on call results, the most important information on the project and its results published on the Anthropocene PRA's website and in all promotional materials made by the Anthropocene PRA, as well as for purposes of settling / reporting on the implementation of tasks in the Anthropocene PRA. Moreover, the results of the completed research shall be presented by the Applicant (or a person authorised by them) at seminars / conferences / meetings held in the Anthropocene PRA, in accordance with the PRA Coordinator's decision.
- 7. By the date named in the Terms and Conditions of the 'Young Labs' (YL) action in the Anthropocene PRA under the strategic programme Excellence Initiative under the Strategic Programme Excellence Initiative at the Jagiellonian University in the academic year 2020/2021 for founding or consolidating a research team to carry out research within the thematic scope

of the Anthropocene PRA, they will present, pursuant to the Call's Terms and Conditions, a final report on its implementation.

Annexes

INFORMATION ON PERSONAL DATA PROCESSING

Pursuant to Article 13 of the Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council (EU) 2016/679 of 27 April 2016 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data and on the free movement of such data and repealing Directive 95/46/EC (General Data Protection Regulation, hereinafter: GDPR), the Jagiellonian University informs that:

- 1. **The Controller** of your personal data is the Jagiellonian University, ul. Gołębia 24, 31-007 Kraków, represented by the JU Rector.
- 2. **The Jagiellonian University has appointed a Data Protection Officer at** ul. Czapskich 4, 31-110 Krakow, room no 27. The Officer can be contacted via e-mail: iod@uj.edu.pl by phone at 12 663 12 25, from Monday to Friday between 8 a.m. and 3 p.m.
- 3. Your personal data provided in the call entry will be processed:
 - a) in the case of all Participants: for the purpose of launching and carrying out the call, and announcing its results, in accordance with these Terms and Conditions (hereinafter: the Call) pursuant to Article 6.1.f of the GDPR, i.e. for the purposes of the legitimate interests pursued by the controller, which consists in naming the laureate of the Call;
 - b) in the case of Participants who are the laureates in the Call: for the purpose of legal obligations imposed on the Call's Host, including in particular the tax obligations, i.e. pursuant to Article 6.1.c of the GDPR.
- 4. While providing your personal data is voluntary, it is a necessary prerequisite for taking part in the Call. Not providing personal data precludes participation in the Call. In the case of Participants referred to under point 3.b above, providing the data constitutes a legal obligation, and failing to provide them shall preclude awarding the Participant.
- 5. The personal data of the Participants shall be published on the University's websites, and they may be published in the University's social media. These data may also be made available to authorised public authorities, including, in particular, to the extent that these authorities are authorised to verify the fulfilment of the legal obligations imposed on the Call's Host.
- 6. Your personal data shall not be transferred to third countries (outside the EEA) / to international organisations.
- 7. Personal data of the Participants referred to under point 3.a above shall be processed until the Call is concluded and its results announced, and subsequently until the expiration of claims which may arise from the Call.
 - Personal data of the Participants referred to under point 3.b above shall be processed in the period resulting from fiscal regulations, and subsequently, for archiving purposes, pursuant to applicable legal regulations.

- 8. You have the following rights: to obtain information on personal data processing and rights resulting from the GDPR, to access your data and rectify them, as well as to have them deleted from the controller's database (unless further processing is necessary for fulfilling a legal obligation or for the purposes of determining, pursuing, or defending claims), to limit their processing or transfer, and to object to the processing of the data in the cases and under the conditions specified in the GDPR.
- 9. Your personal data will not be subject to automated decision making or profiling.
- 10. You have the right to lodge a complaint with the President of the Office for Personal Data Protection, should you ascertain that the processing of your personal data violates the provisions of the GDPR.

place, date, legible signa	ture	

I hereby confirm that I have read and understood the above information..

Annex 2 to Terms and Conditions

Proposal evaluation criteria

Please note: proposal evaluation criteria are identical for both applicant groups, i.e. 'My First Lab' and 'My Advanced Lab,' but proposals are reviewed separately for either group.

1. Formal criteria to be fulfilled by the proposal, including the following considerations:

- Is the Applicant employed by the JU, and have they submitted a declaration of being counted in the N number in one of the disciplines specified in the Anthropocene PRA?
- Has the applicant named at least two research disciplines related to the project (including at least one of those specified for the Anthropocene PRA, https://anthropocene.id.uj.edu.pl/strategia)?
- Does the Applicant fulfil the criterion of young researcher specified in the Call's Terms and Conditions?
- Is the project's budget within the limit of: PLN 200,000
- Is the proposal complete? Has the applicant submitted all necessary declarations, supported the proposal with all annexes, filled out all fields in the form?
- Has the proposal been submitted within the time frame specified in the call announcement?

Proposals failing to meet the formal eligibility criteria shall not be subject to further evaluation.

2. Research evaluation criteria

Note: all projects must meet at least the criteria of interdisciplinarity and internationalisation (the 4*I principle as defined in JU EI.RU application).

- a) Expert's tasks:
- evaluation of interdisciplinarity, internationalization, innovation and integration, scoring: 0-4 points. Obtaining '0' score for interdisciplinarity and internationalization from at least two out of three expert reviewers results in the rejection of the proposal,
- preliminary evaluation of the project, including: the project's relevance for the Anthropocene PRA thematic scope, cost estimate, expected results. Based on this evaluation, the proposal is approved for further evaluation or rejected: evaluation by an expert requires written justification.
- b) Reviewer: evaluation criteria:

Ouality: 60%

- 1. Scientific quality of the project, goals and objectives of the proposed research, research methodology, innovative nature of the research:40%,
- 2. Interdisciplinarity of the research:

5%,

3. The applicant's experience conducting research assessed based on the listed up to 5 research achievements from the entire period of academic activity (e.g. the applicant's research / publication achievements, fellowships abroad, participation in research projects as principal investigator / co-investigator, papers delivered on specialist conferences. Note: CV is not attached to the proposal).

Outreach: 20%

- 4. Ways of making public the results achieved (e.g. through publications, monographs, patents, books): 5%,
- 5. Ways of disseminating the knowledge of the research or outreach and community engagement actions, outlook towards application: 5%,
- 6. Internationalisation: the effect of the proposed actions on the development of an enduring international collaboration (e.g. initiation or continuation of international collaboration aimed at preparing a publication or submitting a research project proposal; a fellowship planned at a research entity abroad):

 5%,
- 7. Project implemented as continuation of ongoing research: work plan, prospective partners, funding institution: 5%.

Implementation: 20%

- 8. Work plan for research and other activities, including stating whether it is rational and whether the time and costs planned are relevant and contribute to the completion of goals in the project:

 10%,
- 9. Access to infrastructure: can the entity /-ies acting as the host institution(s) for the research offer necessary infrastructure? Can possible inadequacies in equipment be supplemented by purchase or by other means of access to infrastructure?

 5%,
- 10. Members of the research team: is the selection relevant for the actions planned in the schedule; actions intended to found or consolidate a research team?

 5%.

The reviewers are obliged to draw up a justification of the suggested score (for each main criterion, i.e. Quality, Outreach, Implementation, justification should be drawn up in 800 to 1,200 characters, not incl. spaces).

Annex 3 to Terms and Conditions

Call committee and reviewers

- 1. The call committee consists of:
- a) committee chair, i.e. the Coordinator of the Anthropocene PRA or a member of the Anthropocene PRA Executive Team (ET) authorised by them,
- b) committee members: representatives of eight faculties involved in the implementation of the PRA Anthropocene actions, including at least two persons from the Anthropocene PRA Executive Team, appointed by the committee chair in concert with the head of the Anthropocene PRA Steering Team; note: the committee chair is at the same time a representative of their faculty,
- c) committee secretary: selected from among the committee's members at request of the committee chair.
- 2. The committee's tasks include:
- a) verifying formal eligibility of the proposals submitted to the call and rejecting the proposals that do not meet the eligibility criteria.
- b) appointing a team of experts and reviewers and passing the proposals that meet formal criteria on for review.

- c) verifying formal correctness of the call proposals by the experts and reviewers; confirmation of the final list of proposals recommended for funding.
- d) evaluating reports on project implementation submitted by the laureates half way through project implementation. Decisions on approving reports or withholding funding of a project are passed by the committee chair.
- e) evaluating final reports on project implementation. Decisions on approving final reports are passed by the chair of the call committee.

The call committee chair shall lay down the detailed arrangements for its operations.

3. The call committee appoints three experts from a group of specialists: research staff of the JU, representing at least two disciplines indicated by the applicants in the proposal. Number of experts from particular university faculties appointed for a given call edition depends on the number of proposals and their assignment to individual categories by the applicants.

4. An Expert shall:

- a) evaluate compliance with the 4*I principle,
- b) perform preliminary assessment of a project and recommend it for evaluation by reviewers. Failure to secure recommendations fro at least two out of three experts precludes further evaluation of the proposal,
- c) upon examining the proposal, present the committee with three reviewers, specialists not employed by the JU, to carry out a review of the proposal.
- 5. Out of nine reviewers recommended by the experts, the call committee selects three to carry out the evaluation of the project.
- 6. The task of the reviewers is to carry out merit-based evaluation of the proposals in accordance with the specified criteria and to provide justification.
- 7. Arrangements for the operations of the expert team and reviewers shall be agreed by the committee, with the reservation that:
- a) Each proposal passed on to reviewers for evaluation shall be evaluated by three reviewers representing at least two disciplines named by the Applicant. Each reviewer evaluating the proposal shall draw up a written review of the proposal.

- b) The project's final note shall be agreed by the experts based on the reviews. The verdict requires written justification.
- 8. Upon verifying formal eligibility of the final notes awarded to the project by the call committee, the committee compiles a ranking list.
- 9. The verdict on awarding funding is announced by the call chair based on the ranking list.
- 10. The number of projects recommended for funding depends on the budget allocated for a given call edition and the merit-based quality of the proposals submitted. The call committee decides on the minimum required number of points to be scored by a project on evaluation for it to be granted funding in a given edition of the call.
- 11. Appeals against the call conclusion verdict shall be lodged with the call committee through the call committee chair within one month of the date of publishing the call results. Please note: only formal faults of the proposal evaluation procedure may constitute the basis for an appeal (there shall be no appealing against the verdict passed by experts or reviewers).